

Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group Turkey

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minute

29 January 2019 UNHCR Ankara and Gaziantep

Chaired by: Ahmet Unver (UNHCR), Line Rindebaek, (WFP), Salah Hamwi (CARE)

Hosted by: UNHCR Country Office (Ankara), Sub-Office (Gaziantep)

Participants:

Ankara:

Ahmet Unver	UNHCR – Co-Chair
Line Rindebaek	WFP – Co-Chair
Hiba Hanano	WFP
Livio Mercurio	UNHCR
Andrea Markham	WFP
Bahadur Murat Akin	ILO
Hanifi Kinacı	TRC
Ayman Sallawy Alhalb	TRC
Aysha Twose	WFP

Gaziantep:

Leila Mamadashvili	UNHCR
Marc Herzog	WHH
Salah Hamwi	CARE – NGO Advisor
Omar Alsmail	IOM

- Agenda:**
1. Introduction of new CBI Chair
 2. 2018 Stock Taking
 - Overview
 - CBI Mapping – key highlights
 3. 2019 CBI TWG Approach – open discussion on:
 - Key Priorities
 - Member requirements & expectations
 - Meeting Cycle
 - NGO Technical Advisor Role
 - TOR Update
 4. Market Update (WFP VAM)
 5. AOB

- Action Points**
- CBI delivery platforms template for partner inputs: partners to provide inputs on their financial service providers for the disbursement of cash, and distribution and administration of vouchers. **Deadline: 8 March**
 - Draft overview of CBI Delivery Mechanisms in Turkey: partners to add further information (in track changes) in the document – for example under “Pros” and “Cons”. **Deadline: 8 March**
 - Finalise the CBI Mapping & and present results to STF (and other working groups when possible).
 - Update work plan with discussed priorities and revised version circulated.
 - Advertise NGO Technical Advisor Role. **Deadline by end February.**
 - TOR to be updated. **Deadline by end February.**
 - PPT template for potential partner updates to be share with MoM.

1. Introduction of new CBI Chair

New CBI TWG UNHCR Co-Chair, Ahmet Unver was introduced to the group. Line Rindebaek is the current WFP co-chair. Livio Mercurio (UNHCR) and Andrea Markham (WFP) will support CBI TWG work on technical issues. Salah Hamwi (CARE) will remain as NGO technical Advisor until end of March 2019.

2. 2018 Stock Taking (Overview, November Meeting Update & CBI Mapping)

Meeting / Activity Overview: An overview was provided of the key meeting outcomes, discussions and tools which CBI TWG has focused on in 2018. Extended version of this review may be seen in the provided presentation document. Below, highlights of the review are shared:

January meeting:

- 13-14 July 2017 workshop, outcomes and reports were followed up by members
- Workplan of 2018 was reviewed
- Members decided that WFP work on CBI mapping and online data collection

February meeting:

- WFP online survey to collect information on CBI programs and modalities was shared
- NGO partner as Technical Advisor was elected
- CBI TWG Decision Tree (prezi document) was presented
- CBI in sectors, CBI reporting issues and Emergency Cash was discussed

March meeting:

- Follow-up: data collection from partners for mapping were shared
- UNHCR presented the draft definition of the 'cash for emergency' and the proposed decision tree for its reporting.

April meeting:

- Care presented: CBR TWG (North-West Syria coordinator), OCHA premises in Gaziantep. Composition of the TWG, developed tools, common challenges were discussed.
- WFP presented market dynamics in Turkey (2017)

May meeting:

- Following discussions at various WGs (ISWG, BN WG) and the STF, Emergency Cash Reporting Guidance was finalised
- Discussed: CBI TWG location, ToR, enhanced coordination, participation (SE)

June meeting:

- Winter support and ESSN overlap in-depth analysis was discussed
- IOM briefed: winterization PDM initial findings, details were to be shared in BNWG

August meeting:

- Discussed: Alternative to Camps
- Regional CaLP meeting: WFP represented Turkey, lessons learned shared, training needs asked, transition to livelihoods

October meeting:

- Winter support programs, targets and timing were shared by partners
- WFP presented results of market monitoring exercises: increased gap between needs and received monthly income support and increase in negative coping strategies were discussed
- Workplan revised and simplified, measurable outputs were suggested

-
- Logos for CBI TWG were discussed.

November meeting:

The group were reminded of the action points and the tools shared after the November meeting. This meeting focused on the main CBI delivery mechanisms in Turkey (Kizilay & PTT) and included discussions on delivery platforms:

- Draft CBI delivery platform overview (starting with Kizilay and PTT)
- CBI delivery platforms template for partner inputs:
 - **ACTION POINT:** partners to provide inputs on their financial service providers for the disbursement of cash, and distribution and administration of vouchers. **Deadline: 8 March**
- Draft overview of CBI Delivery Mechanisms in Turkey:
 - **ACTION POINT:** partners to add further information (in track changes) in the document – for example under “Pros” and “Cons”. **Deadline: 8 March**

A brief update from LHWG Coordinator was conveyed by WFP co-chair on the “Guidelines for Short Term Employment/ Cash-Based Interventions related to Livelihoods activities in Turkey”: A LHWG CfW core group have had two meetings in Ankara and in Gaziantep and have so far discussed the proposed scope of guidelines, the definition of CfW activities, and harmonization of modalities. CfW livelihoods activities will be referred to as “short term employment”. ISKUR is the focal point from the government side and it was agreed to include the modalities of ISKUR circulars and Turkish labor law such as daily compensation, working hours per day etc. It was noted that LHWG coordinator is keen to share an update on the guidelines in the coming CBI TWG meeting. The group discussed and agreed that it would be good to have more detailed focus on livelihoods and cash.

CBI mapping: Key Highlights

UNHCR and WFP pointed out the following highlights:

- 18 organizations reported 31 active programmes, for a total of nearly 750 million USD spent in 2018, and nearly 2 million beneficiaries reached.
- Most of the programmes are concentrated in SET, Marmara Region and Ankara, in addition to the nationwide programmes.
- Most of the programmes address basic needs, followed by livelihoods programmes and protection.
- ECHO the biggest donor in Turkey, but other donors finance a number of very diverse programmes, e.g. livelihoods programmes receive significant funding from GIZ, BMZ, etc.
- Great diversity of programmes to highlight during the course of the year, by sector and by donors
- Crosscheck and data sharing is a well-established practice, with many programmes cross-checking their lists against for example the ESSN beneficiary list. However, not all programmes exclude individuals as a result of the cross-checking.
- Most of the emergency cash is meant to cover basic needs, not protection as it was previously supposed
- M&E systems are in place for the vast majority of programmes, but it would be worth to explore what systems and indicators are in use to try to harmonize across the group, and have a wider and uniform picture of the situation of the refugees and the use of cash.
- The mapping also presents two tabs that can be explored in the online dashboard, for cash for work and cash for protection programmes. Both results could be discussed with relevant WGs.

ACTION POINTS:

- If members have any further comments on the CBI mapping, they should please inform Chairs immediately.

- The map will be finalised with a view of presenting it to STF
- IM in UNHCR will contact those organizations that have shared some contradictory information and those that reported for the past mapping in 2018 but not with this exercise.
- CBI TWG members to analyse the information in the mapping following the [link](#)¹, and propose further analysis that could be of interest for the group
- Re-send the questionnaire in pdf format
- Follow up with Livelihoods WG the mapping for further analysis

3. 2019 CBI TWG Approach – open discussion on:

Key Priorities: Four main areas of priority areas were presented to the group as CBI TWG focus for 2019:

- Partner updates / best practices / challenges
- Inter-sectoral Linkages – e.g. Livelihoods & Protection
- Develop tools / guidance on Turkey specific context – e.g. on Delivery mechanism and technologies & Common M/E indicators
- Learning on thematic technical topics:

There was general consensus among the group that these areas were appropriate for 2019 with several flagging the need to focus on inter-sectoral linkages - especially with LWG and it was agreed that CBI TWG could support LWG with analysis and guidance notes if needed (for example on mapping of activities, including cash for training). Several members emphasized the need to improve programme quality for CBI and highlight cross cutting issues such as monitoring cash, advocating for appropriate transfer values, mainstreaming gender sensitivity, etc.

On the subject of monitoring and evaluation activities specifically, it was mentioned that a workshop could be held to discuss what MEAL systems are in place, what indicators are periodically measured by different agencies delivering cash, what could and should be a minimum common set of variables and expected outcomes to report to the CBI TWG to show the contribution of cash transfers for the achievement of multiple objectives. Sweepback from beneficiary accounts, could also be a focus for future meetings. ILO offered to provide information about KYC legislation, and WFP mentioned that TRC has also been dealing extensively with this area; CBI mapping shows that a number of programmes are implementing direct cash in Turkey, therefore it would be beneficial for members to have a very clear understanding of what restrictions are imposed by financial regulators in Turkey (for example, requirement to have ID numbers and show ID cards, maximum transaction amounts for refugees, and so on).

It was agreed that the next meeting will focus on cash in Livelihoods.

Cycle of Meetings: The group agreed to change from monthly to bimonthly meetings to allow participants to provide better inputs since frequency tends to prevent contributions. The workplan will be updated to reflect 1) the key topics mentioned above and 2) the bi-monthly cycle.

NGO Technical Advisor Role: The NGO Technical Advisor, Salah Hamwi, provided an overview of the roles and responsibilities of this position and outlined the requirements:

- Representing NGOs in meetings and TWG leadership
- Provide technical inputs on cash-based programmes
- Participate in briefing/orientation activities for new members
- Establish regular technical exchange with NNGOs and INGOs mechanisms
- Link with regional NGO co-chairs in the Syria Crises Response
- Contribute to TWG documents on behalf of NGOs
- Act as Co-Chair if needed

¹<https://app.powerbi.com/view?r=eyJrjoiNTNjZDIhZDAzMjIiMi00NGJmLWJkOTctYzBINjY3OWIzMTAzIiwidCI6ImU1YzY3OTgxLTY2NjQ0NDZlYzY3OTY1NDNkMmFmODBiZSIsImMiOiJh9>

Requirements

- Time and technical capacity
- NGO linkages / relationships

It was noted that the position will be advertised soon, and members with capacity are encouraged to consider taking this role on. WHH noted their interest although current HR capacity complicates them taking this position on.

TOR Update: It was noted that the TOR will be updated and circulated for review before the next meeting to reflect on new cycle of meetings etc.

ACTION POINTS:

- Discussed themes to be included in updated work plan and circulated.
- Meeting cycle will be bimonthly
- NGO Technical Advisor Role to be advertised
- TOR to be updated

4. Market Update - Turkish Economy Q4,2018- Impact of refugees in Turkey (WFP VAM)

WFP provided an overview of the economic situation in Q4, the key findings of the bulletin are:

- The GoT released their New Economic Program in September, intended to respond to high inflation, the current account deficit and economic volatility
 - The plan includes a 2019 annual inflation target of 15.9%, and 2.3% economic growth.
 - Within the framework of the New Economic Program, two initiatives were announced in Q4
 - The 'All-out Fight Against Inflation' including a variety of measures to reduce prices and support small/medium enterprises
 - The Tax Reduction Plan, including a number of tax cuts effective until end of March 2019.
- Inflation reached a record high in October 2018 at 25.24%, but reduced to 20.30% by the end of December
- In December 2018, the Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey maintained interest rates at 24%.
- In December 2018, the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services announced an increase in the minimum wage by 26%.
- When comparing to Q1 and Q2, the third quarter sectoral growth have witnessed a significant reduction in the agriculture, manufacturing and construction sectors.
- WFP estimates that even with ESSN assistance and income, refugees are unable to meet their basic needs. The gap in December is 62.5 TL per person per month. This figure was 49 TL at the end of Q3.
- Alternative coping mechanisms: PDM data shows that refugee food consumption score is decreasing, amount of debt has increased, and livelihoods coping strategies are deteriorating.
- On the other hand, energy prices have gone down, which is positive especially due to winter season
- Implications
 - Cash-based assistance should be adjusted to account for inflation, however tensions already exist between refugees and host community; and increasing the assistance could accelerate the tension.
 - Refugees are at higher risk of unemployment during recessions
 - Increasing unemployment in 2019, which may lead to more competition in informal sector

Increasing use of coping strategies and competition may contribute to social tensions which would imply economic changes and job search difficulties.

Please note all WFP/TRC Market Updates can be found here:

<https://www1.wfp.org/publications/turkey-emergency-social-safety-net-market-bulletin>

5. AOB

It was noted that a PPT template will be shared with the minutes. The template provides the parameters for potential partner updates / presentations in CBI TWG meetings.

Next meeting: The next CBI TWG meeting is tentatively planned for the fourth week of March 2019, date and time will be confirmed closer to the time.